Report Identification Number: RO-14-021 Prepared by: Rochester Regional Office

Issue Date: 5/18/2015

This	s report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns:
X	A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
	The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
	The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
	The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may <u>only</u> be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.

RO-14-021 FINAL Page 1 of 11

## Abbreviations

Relationships						
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child				
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child				
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father				
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider				
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father				
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle				
	Contacts					
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner				
DrDoctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services				
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother				
CPR-Cardio-pulmonary Resuscitation						
	Allegations					
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts				
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding				
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse				
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	MN-Medical Neglect	EdN-Educational Neglect				
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive				
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision				
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Others					
	Miscellaneous					
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender				
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence				
LDSS-Local Department of Social	ACS-Administration for Children's	NYPD-New York City Police				
Service	Services	Department				
PPRS-Purchased Preventive						
Rehabilitative Services						

**Case Information** 

**Report Type:** Child Deceased **Jurisdiction:** Ontario **Date of Death:** 11/07/2014

Age: 4 month(s) Gender: Male Initial Date OCFS Notified: 11/07/2014

#### **Presenting Information**

At 3:00 am and 6:00 am the BM fed the SC and put him to bed in his crib. At 8:00am the BM found the SC not breathing the BM called 911 emergency services. The SC was otherwise a normal healthy child. The paramedic attempted to revive the SC but the SC was dead at that time.

#### **Executive Summary**

OCDSS received an SCR report on 11/7/14 with allegations of IG and DOA/Fatality regarding the 4 month-old SC. The subject of the report was the BM, the BF, and 2 OC were listed as no role. According to OCDSS documentation the BM fed the SC at 3:00 am and again at 6:00 am then placed the SC in his crib on his back; there was a small blanket in the crib. The BM was bottle feeding in addition to adding baby cereal to the bottle. The BM reported that sometimes the SC would throw up after eating and there was some history of reflux. The BM went into the nursery at 8:00 am and found the SC not moving with vomit all over the crib, his face, and neck. The BM called emergency medical and attempted CPR when the ambulance arrived the SC was taken to the hospital and pronounced dead at 9:00 am.

According to the autopsy report the cause and manner of death are pending.

There are 2 half-sibling ages 9 and 7. OCDSS interviewed the siblings and they reported no concerns. According to the 2 OC, they stated they heard the BM yelling and asking for the phone; when they entered the nursery they saw the SC being held by the BM the SC had vomit on his face and clothing. The 2 OC reported that they are well taken care of by the BM and SF. The 2 OC appeared healthy and interacted well with their parents.

OCDSS received SCR reports on 7/3/08, 11/24/08, 12/13/08, 6/18/10, 5/2/10 6/8/12 and 8/15/11 with allegations of IG, LS and SA regarding the 2 OC. The subjects were the BM and SF. In each event OCDSS conducted an assessment of immediate danger, completed safety and risk assessments and gathered sufficient information to make all determinations for all allegations of abuse and maltreatment. The SCR report of 8/15/11 was indicated for IG and SA against the SF and the case was open for preventive services. All other aforementioned SCR reports were unfounded and closed. There are no corrective actions needed.

## Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

#### **Safety Assessment:**

• Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:

o Approved Initial Safety Assessment? Yes

• Safety assessment due at the time of determination? Yes

• Was the safety decision on the approved Initial Safety Assessment Yes appropriate?

RO-14-021 FINAL Page 3 of 11

Determination:			
	on gathered to make determ y others identified in the cou	<b>\</b> /	Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations.
• Was the determination rappropriate?	nade by the district to unfou	ınd or indicate	Yes
Was the decision to close the ca	se appropriate?		Yes
Was casework activity commen or regulatory requirements?		l relevant statutory	Yes
Was there sufficient documenta	tion of supervisory consulta	tion?	Yes, the case record notes a consultation took place, but no details noted.
	Required Actions Rela	ated to the Fatality	
	-	-	
Are there Required Actions rela	ated to the compliance issue	(s)? □Yes ⊠No	
Fatal	ity-Related Information	and Investigative	Activities
	Incident Info	ormation	
<b>Date of Death:</b> 11/07/2014	Т	ime of Death: 09:00	AM
County where fatality incident	occurred:	ONTARIO	)
Was 911 or local emergency nu		Yes	
Time of Call:		Unknown	
Did EMS to respond to the scen	ie?	Yes	
At time of incident leading to do		or drugs? N/A	
Child's activity at time of incide		3	
⊠ Sleeping	☐ Working		Driving / Vehicle occupant
☐ Playing ☐ Other	☐ Eating		Unknown
Did child have supervision at tin How long before incident was the Is the caretaker listed in the Ho 1 At time of incident supervisor wimpaired.	he child last seen by caretak ousehold Composition? Yes	er? 2 Hours	
Total number of deaths at incid Children ages 0-18: 1	ent event:		

RO-14-021 FINAL Page 4 of 11

#### Household Composition at time of Fatality

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Male	4 Month(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Father	No Role	Male	30 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	34 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Female	9 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Male	7 Year(s)

#### **LDSS Response**

OCDSS received an SCR report on 11/7/14 with allegations of IG and DOA/Fatality regarding the 4 month old SC. The subject of the report was the BM; the BF and 2 OC were named as no role. On 11/7/14 OCDSS interviewed the BM who reported that she fed the SC at 6:00 am. She fed the SC formula and baby cereal then placed him in his crib on his back. She stated that there was a small blanket in the crib but nothing else. The BM further reported that around 8:00 am she was getting the 2 OC ready for school and that the noise usually wakes the SC. The BM did not hear the SC crying so the BM went to check on him. When she got to the room the SC had vomit on his crib, head and neck and was not breathing. The BM picked the SC up and called for her oldest child to call 911. The BM attempted CPR while she waited for the ambulance, when the ambulance arrived they took over CPR and transported the SC to the hospital where he was pronounced dead at 9:00am. OCDSS interviewed the 2 OC who reported a similar account of the morning. The 2 OC children reported that they entered the bedroom when they heard the BM yell; both children reported seeing the SC with vomit on his face and neck. The 2 OC had no CPS concerns and they interacted well with the BM and BF. The BF was not home when the SC was discovered; the BF reported no concerns. The BM and BF stated that the 2 OC would be going to stay with a maternal aunt for a couple of days. So the BM and BF had time to make funeral arrangements.

OCDSS conducted an assessment of immediate danger to the surviving children in the report within 24 hours, completed safety and risk assessments, made all appropriate collateral contacts with law enforcement, doctors, and non-custodial parents, and gathered sufficient information to make determinations for all allegations of abuse and maltreatment. OCDSS offered appropriate services to the family and the BM agreed to enter grief counseling. The SCR report of 11/7/14 was unfounded on 2/17/15 due to no creditable evidence to substantiate the allegations. The family was offered grief counseling and the BM accepted.

#### Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Pending

Primary Cause of Death: Unknown

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Hospital physician

#### Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)?Yes

RO-14-021 FINAL Page 5 of 11

## Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team?Yes

## **SCR Fatality Report Summary**

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome
015005 - Deceased Child, Male, 4 Month(s)	015002 - Mother, Female, 34 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
015005 - Deceased Child, Male, 4 Month(s)		Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated

## **CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities**

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?	×			
When appropriate, children were interviewed?	×			
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	×			
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?	×			
Contact with source?	×			
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?	×			
Was a death-scene investigation performed?		×		
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?	X			
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?	×			
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?	×			

### **Fatality Safety Assessment Activities**

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?	×			
Was there an adequate safety assessment of impending or immediate din the household named in the report:	langer to su	rviving sib	lings/other	children
Within 24 hours?	×			
At 7 days?	×			

RO-14-021 FINAL Page 6 of 11

#### NYS Office of Children and Family Services - Child Fatality Report X At 30 days? Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving X siblings/ other children in the household within 24 hours? Are there any safety issues that need to be referred back to the local X $\Box$ district? When safety factors were present that placed the surviving siblings/other children in the household in impending or immediate $\boxtimes$ danger of serious harm, were the safety interventions, including parent/caretaker actions adequate? Fatality Risk Assessment / Risk Assessment Profile

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Was the risk assessment/RAP adequate in this case?	$\boxtimes$			
During the course of the investigation, was sufficient information gathered to assess risk to all surviving siblings/other children in the household?	X			
Was there an adequate assessment of the family's need for services?	$\boxtimes$			
Did the protective factors in this case require the LDSS to file a petition in Family Court at any time during or after the investigation?		X		
Were appropriate/needed services offered in this case	X			

#### Placement Activities in Response to the Fatality Investigation

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Did the safety factors in the case show the need for the surviving siblings/other children in the household be removed and placed in foster care at any time during this fatality investigation?		X		
Were there surviving siblings/other children in the household removed as a result of this fatality report/investigation?		×		

#### **Legal Activity Related to the Fatality**

Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity

RO-14-021 FINAL Page 7 of 11

#### Services Provided to the Family in Response to the Fatality

Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	Needed but not Offered	Needed but Unavaliable	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling	X						
<b>Economic support</b>						X	
Funeral arrangements						$\boxtimes$	
Housing assistance						$\boxtimes$	
Mental health services						$\boxtimes$	
Foster care						$\boxtimes$	
Health care						X	
Legal services						X	
Family planning						X	
Homemaking Services						X	
Parenting Skills						$\boxtimes$	
<b>Domestic Violence Services</b>						$\boxtimes$	
<b>Early Intervention</b>						$\boxtimes$	
Alcohol/Substance abuse						×	
Child Care						×	
Intensive case management						X	
Family or others as safety resources						X	
Other						X	

Were services provided to parent(s) and other care givers to address any immediate needs related to the fatality? Yes

#### **Explain:**

The parents were offered grief counseling, the BM accepted services for herself and the OC...

### **History Prior to the Fatality**

## Child Information

Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment?

No
Was there an open CPS case with this child at the time of death?

No
Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the death?

No

Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prior to this child's death? No

RO-14-021 FINAL Page 8 of 11

Was the child ac	cutely ill during the two w		No		
		Infants Under One Yea	ar Old		
ъ.	43				
During pregnand	•		☐ Had boovy ale	aahal uga	
	omplications / infections the-counter or prescription	<ul><li>☐ Had heavy alcohol use</li><li>☐ Smoked tobacco</li></ul>			
☐ Experienced d		☐ Used illicit dr			
-	in the case record to have	□ Osca illicit di	ugs		
was not noted	in the case record to have	any of the issues fisted			
Infant was born:	:				
☐ Drug exposed			☐ With fetal alc	ohol effects or syn	drome
☑ With neither o	of the issues listed noted in	case record		-	
	CPS - Investigat	ive History Three Ye	ears Prior to the	Fatality	
		ave mistory rance re		i acancy	
Date of SCR	Alleged	Alleged		Status/Outcome	Compliance
Report	Victim(s)	Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Status/Outcome	Issue(s)
08/16/2011	2044 - Sibling, Female, 9		_	Indicated	No
	Years	Years	Guardianship	marcatea	110
	2044 - Sibling, Female, 9	· · · · ·	Sexual Abuse	Indicated	
	Years	Years			
Report Summar	<b>y:</b> h her mother during the we	als and vigita with the CE	the DE of the OC	on woolkanda Wh	ila with the CE
	t he put his fingers in her "				
	leep in the same bed as the				
	investigation with the Onta				
the SF.		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,			
Determination: 1	Indicated		Date of Determina	tion: 11/21/2011	
Basis for Determ					
1	of 8/16/11 was indicated ag		-	-	
	she initially made a disclosi				
	While engaged in therapy it child that had been sexuall	*		•	
	als and the SF and OC eng				
	could continue therapy. The				proventive
OCFS Review R			<u> </u>	<u> </u>	
OCDSS made app	propriate collateral contacts	s with services providers,	, police officers, me	dical providers, th	erapist and the
1	ent. There were no crimina				
1	essed for safety and risk an		d. OCDSS appropria	ately indicated the	SCR report of
	ed the case for on-going pr				
Are there Requi	red Actions related to the	compliance issue(s)?	JYes ⊠No		

RO-14-021 FINAL Page 9 of 11

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Status/Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
05/08/2012	2052 - Sibling, Female, 9 Years	2050 - Mother, Female, 34 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	No

#### Report Summary:

The BM took the 9 year-old OC out of mental health treatment last month against a court order and medical advice. The BM had facilitated the child believing that the SF sexually abused her and is engaging in parental alienation of the SF.

**Determination:** Unfounded **Date of Determination:** 07/11/2012

#### **Basis for Determination:**

The report alleged allegations of IG of the OC by the BM. The BM did take the OC out of mental health services with one provider and engaged in mental health counseling for the OC with a different provider. The BM did continue therapy for the OC as confirmed with a collateral contact.

#### **OCFS Review Results:**

OCDSS made appropriate collateral contacts with services providers, medical providers, and non-custodial parents. The home was appropriately assessed for safety and risk and no concerns were noted. The case was adequately investigated and unfounded and closed on 7/11/12.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)?  $\square$ Yes  $\square$ No

#### **CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Prior to the Fatality**

OCDSS received SCR reports on 7/3/08, 11/24/08, 12/13/08, 6/18/09, and 5/2/10 with allegations of Inadequate Guardianship (IG), and Lack of Supervision (LOS) regarding the 2 surviving children, the subjects of the report were the BM and SF.

In each event, OCDSS conducted an assessment of immediate danger to the surviving brother in the report within 24 hours, completed safety and risk assessments, implemented safety plans when needed, gathered sufficient information to make determinations for all allegations of abuse and maltreatment. All SCR reports were unfounded and closed.

The specific information concerning these investigations is not relevant to the circumstances concerning the subject child's death or the assessment of the adequacy of the district's investigation of the current fatality.

#### **Known CPS History Outside of NYS**

There is no history of CPS outside of NYS

### Services Open at the Time of the Fatality

#### Required Action(s)

Are there Required Actions related to compliance issues for provisions of CPS or Preventive services ? □Yes ⊠No

#### **Preventive Services History**

RO-14-021 FINAL Page 10 of 11

OCDSS received an SCR report on 8/15/11 with allegations of IG and SA regarding the 9 year-old OC. The subject of the report was the SF, the BF to the 9 year-old OC, the BM and 7 year-old OC were listed as no role. The report stated the OC lived with her BM during the week and on weekends went to visit her SF home. While at the SF's home the 9 year-old OC reported that the SF put his fingers in her vagina and that she is forced to sleep in the bed with him. OCDSS conducted a joint investigation with the Ontario County Sheriff Department. The OC child disclosed some SA of her by the SF. The BM and OC agreed to engage in therapy and the report was susbstantiated for IG and SA on 11/21/11. A preventive services case was open to assist in the payment of therapy.

The BM agreed to engage in counseling for the 9 year-old OC. The SF agreed to supervised visit and engaged in therapy. The family was compliant with counseling services and supervised visits. The preventive services case was closed 6/7/12 because the therapist reported that counseling was no longer necessary for the OC; all agreed that in the future if needed the family would re-engage in therapy.

Required Action(s)
Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issues for provision of Foster Care Services? $\square Yes \                                  $
Foster Care Placement History
There is no record of foster care placement history provided to the deceased child, the deceased child's siblings, and/or the other children residing in the deceased child's household at the time of the fatality.
Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality
Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity
Recommended Action(s)
Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes? □Yes ⊠No
Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? □Yes ⊠No

RO-14-021 FINAL Page 11 of 11